

Notes of the meeting of the Surgical STB held at 10:00 am, Tuesday 2nd September via Teams, NHS Education for Scotland

Present: Alastair Murray (AM) [Chair], Emily Baird (EB), Holly Bekarma (HB), Debbie Boyd (DB), John Camilleri-Brenan (JCB), Niki Bruce (NB), Evan Crane (EC), Jennifer Duncan (JD), Martyn Flett (MF), Bryn Jones (BJ), Imran Liaquat (IL), Larissa McFadden (LMcF), David MacGill (DMcG), Ashleigh McGovern (AMcG), Jen MacKenzie (JMacK), Sara Robinson (SR), Philipa Rust (PR), Vinita Shekar (VS), Tamim Siddiqui (TS) & Phil Walmsley (PW)

Apologies: Helen Adamson (HA), Pankaj Agarwal (PA), Jackie Aitken (JA), Reem al Soufi (RaS), Morven Allan (MA), Sudipto Bhatta (SB), Peter Bodkin (PB), James Cameron (JC), Claire Carden (CC), Vikas Chadha (VC), Melenie Clarke (MC), Mark Danton (MD), Russell Duncan (RD), Elizabeth Dominguez (ED), Simon Edgar (SE), Roberta Garau (RG), Simon Gibson (SG), Tim Graham (TG), Kerry Haddow (KH), Ewan Harrison (EH), Thushitha Kunanandam (TK), Stephen Lally (SL), Andrew Martindale (AMa), Alex McCulloch (AMcC), Vhari MacDonald (VMAcD), Lesley Metcalf (LM), Andrew Murray (AnMu), Hugh Pearson (HP), Helen Pratt (HP), Alison Ramsay (AR), Campbell Roxburgh (CR), Stuart Suttie (SS), Philip Turner (PT), Peter Wilson (PW), Alun Williams (AW), Satheesh Yalamarthi (SY) Peter Wilson (PW) & David Wynne (DW)

Present: Rachel Brand-Smith (RBS)

Item No	Item	Comment	Action
1.	Welcome & Apologies	<p>The chair noted the apologies and announced the following changes to the STB membership:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr Evan Crane – Now represents the Foundation Programme • Dr Fredrick Burgess – New TPD for Ophthalmology (South-East Region) • Dr Triim Nurm – New TPD T&O (East Region) 	
2.	Notes of the meeting held on 28/02/2025	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The notes of meeting held on 28/02/2025 were accepted by the members 	
3.	Action Points from meeting 28/02/2025	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • See Action Log - September 2026 	

4.	Matters Arising		
4.1	Schedule of STB meetings for 2026	<p>Various issues were discussed related to meetings in 2026 including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> STB Terms of Reference: AM confirmed that STB Terms of Reference are currently under review and suggested three meetings be held in 2026 instead of four. Quality Team Data Reviews: JD highlighted that the Quality Team have the following quality review discussions which are relevant to the STB: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data Review Meeting (First NTS and STS data review) – March 2026 Data Review Meeting (Second NTS and STS data review) – September 2026 Specialty Quality Management Group Review – November 2026 Recruitment Team Data Reviews: JMack noted that the Recruitment Team have the following recruitment deadlines which may be relevant to the STB: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicant Data Deadline – March 2026 Fill Rate Results – Summer 2026 Next Year's Recruitment Round – October 2026 2026 Meeting Dates: AM suggested the following dates and topic areas for 2026: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 10/03/2026 – Recruitment Issues, Workforce Planning & ARCP Preparation 10/09/2025 – Quality Management Discussions 01/12/2026 – ARCP Result Discussions 	<p>RBS to send out TEAMS invitations for the Surgery STB meeting dates</p>
4.2	Core Surgery Educational Programme	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> AM requested that this item be rolled over to the next meeting as SY was unable to attend. 	<p>RBS to add Core Surgery Education Programme discussion item to the 13/11/2025 meeting agenda</p>

4.3	Surgery APGD Restructuring	<p>The following issues were discussed regarding the restructuring of APGD posts including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New APGD Roles: AM outlined the proposal to realign NES regions to three geographical areas, West, South-East and North-East. In response, MDAG have approved changing the present APGD posts in Surgery to align with these areas. The three APGDs will take on national remits with a portfolio of surgical specialties. It is hoped this will improve the consistency of decision making and advice for TPDs and RDiTs across Scotland. It will also allow APGDs to develop specialty expertise and advise NES accordingly. Changes so Far: AM confirmed that Bryn Jones has been reappointed as Surgery APGD in the West. In addition to this, Stuart Suttie has demitted as APGD for the South-East, Melanie Clarke has demitted from the North and Russell Duncan has demitted from the East. The East and North regions will be merged. The two vacant posts will be advertised in the coming months. 	
4.4	CCT to Consultant Transition –		
4.4.1	Senior Fellowships	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> AM presented a paper proposing the creation of a Fellowship post which would apply to resident doctors pre and possibly post CCT. The Fellowships would be a bespoke programme created in tandem with employers with current or impending vacancies. Posts would concentrate on the specific skills requirements for upcoming consultant vacancies with individual employers. 	
4.4.2	Issues related to Fellowship Roles	<p>The members discussed the following issues related to the proposed Fellowship posts including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Types of Fellowships: EC noted that any proposed Fellowship should be distinct from any pre-CCT Registrar role. PW noted the lack of regulation around the creation of post CCT Fellowship posts and suggested a specific set of standards be created. AM responded that the proposed pre-CCT fellowships would remain under the governance of NES. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Acting Up: HB asked if resident doctors would be required to 'act up' in a proposed Fellowship role. If this was the case, there may be an impact on resident doctor rotas. AM confirmed that resident doctors may be asked to act up if appropriate for their training, and any impact would have to be considered. • Extension of Training: PW highlighted the problem of 'additional training' spilling over into consultant positions. PW noted that this could be viewed as an extension of training which would have a knock-on effect on training programmes. In addition to this, PW asked if resident doctors would have to be Out of Programme for some aspects of the Fellowship. AM responded that the proposal was for pre-CCT fellowship within programme if possible. • Impact on other Resident Doctors: SR highlighted the need to make sure proposed Fellowships do not prevent any other resident doctor from accessing the required number of cases for their Logbooks. • Preparation for Management Skills: EC stated that it would be very useful to teach resident doctors general management and administrative skills. MF noted that a similar system is used in Pediatrics to introduce management skills to resident doctors. • Who can apply for post: EB asked whether these posts would be restricted to Scottish resident doctors or open to non-Scottish applicants. AM stated that they would most likely be open to all applicants although the exact process for recruitment had not been worked out. • Longer Placements: SR suggested that this approach could be used to provide resident doctors with longer placements. • Next Steps: AM thanked the members for their comments and said he will bring this back to the STB in due course. 		
5.	Standing Items of Business		

5.1	Deanery Issues		
5.1.1	Training Management	<p>AMcG gave the members the following update regarding TPM activities including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2026 Recruitment: AMcG confirmed that TPM have concluded the 2025 recruitment cycle and will now move to the August 2026 cycle. TPM will be in contact with TPDs to discuss posts as soon as possible. Round 3 February 2026 Posts: AMcG confirmed that one post in OMF and one post in Ophthalmology will start in February 2026. February 2026 Rotations: AMcG confirmed TPM will be in contact with TPDs regarding rotation deadline dates. Less than Full Time: AMcG confirmed that Form A and Form B have been combined which will streamline the application process. Information has been sent out to all stakeholders. 	
5.1.2	IDTs and IRTs	<p>Various issues regarding IDTs and IRTs were discussed including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> IRT February 2026: AMcG confirmed that the February application window has just opened for IRTs. IDT February 2026: AMcG confirmed that the IDT application window has just closed. IDTs Operational Group: AM confirmed that he now represents NES on the Four Nations IDT Operational group. This group has been discussing issues related to transfer requests within the first 12 months of a post. AM noted that the group is interested in the Scottish IRT model which does not allow applications in the first year (unless under exceptional circumstances). 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Type 5 Criteria: AM stated that the number of applications using this criterion is being monitored. AM noted that there has not been a significant increase in applications so far. • Review of IRT Applications: AM stated that there will be a review of how IRT applications are prioritised and how IRT demands are balanced against other requirements such as academic posts. 	
5.1.3	Professional Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • AM reminded the members to encourage educators to access materials on the NES website and TURAS site. 	
5.1.4	Recruitment	<p>JMack gave the members the following update regarding Recruitment including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Round 3 Interviews: JMack confirmed that Round 3 offers will be confirmed at the end of October. • OMFS Recruitment: OMFS is moving to ST1 only recruitment across the UK from 2027. • Timeline for T&O Recruitment: JMack confirmed that Recruitment is revising the T&O recruitment process and criteria for 2026. This will be finalised by the end of October before applications open. • GMC Registration for all Applicants: JMack confirmed that all applicants from all specialties will have to have GMC registration before any application in 2026. Applicants do not, however, require a license to practice. JMack confirmed that this is an attempt to manage the volume of applications. • PGV Issues: AM highlighted that the PGV rules have changed. SR confirmed that the changes have not caused significant delays. • Foundation Applications: JMack confirmed that Foundation allocations will now be random, and applicants will not be able to select their rotations. JMack stated that this is an attempt to make the process more equitable. AM noted however that this may 	

		discourage applicants from considering surgery due to lack of experience in Foundation posts.	
5.1.5	Impact of AI on Application & Interview Process	<p>Various issues regarding the impact of AI on the recruitment process were discussed including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Impact of AI on Application Process: EB stated that there are issues regarding the use of AI in the application and interview process. PW noted that the issue may require the return to face-to-face interviews. PW noted that this issue may also be compounded by the issuing of interview criteria before interviews. Discussion Regarding Issues: AM noted that COPPS and JCST have both raised issues regarding the use of AI. Various alternatives have been suggested including the use of invigilated interview centers. AM noted however that there are issues regarding costs and the efficacy of the face-to-face interview model. 	
5.1.6	Equality & Diversity & Inclusivity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> VS confirmed that she will share the MWRES report with members when it is available. 	VS to share the MWRES report with members when it is available
5.1.7	Quality Management Group		
5.1.7.1	Sites Update	<p>JD gave the members the following update regarding sites under Quality Reviews including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ninewells Hospital, Dundee: JD confirmed that concerns have been raised regarding Foundation posts in General Surgery. JD confirmed that Fiona Cameron will be holding discussion regarding this. Doctor Gray's Hospital, Elgin: JD confirmed there have been ongoing issues regarding T&O rotations. JD confirmed that there have been discussions about the reintroduction of Foundation FY1 to Orthopedics, however this was delayed after a meeting in June. This issue will be reviewed in November at the next Quality Engagement meeting. 	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Raigmore Hospital, Inverness: JD confirmed that resident doctors have been reintroduced in August, and a Review meeting will be held in November. A full Quality Visit will be carried out in March 2026. • Borders General Hospital, Galashiels: JD confirmed that serious issues have been raised by Foundation resident doctors over the past 12 months. This area has now been put on Enhanced Monitoring. A Smart Objectives and Action Planning meeting will be held at the end of the training year. • Glasgow Royal Infirmary, Glasgow: A Quality Management meeting has been held with General Surgery. JD noted that there have been long standing issues with this department and there have been significant attempts to improve doctors' training experience. This department will be discussed in the data review meeting. • University Hospital, Monklands: JD confirmed that Surgery has been taken off Enhanced Monitoring and will now proceed to a Smart Objectives and Action Planning meeting. It is hoped the department will then be removed from the review process. 	
5.1.7.2	Additional Information	<p>JD gave the members an update regarding the Quality Management Team activities including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data Review Meeting: JD confirmed this will take place on 04/09/2025. Outcomes from this meeting will be circulated when available. AM noted that the Scottish Deanery has the highest survey results out of the four nations and thanked the members for their efforts. • Sites in the bottom and top 2% of NTS & STS Surveys: JD confirmed that sites in the bottom 2% will be discussed in the next Data Review meeting. JD noted however that sites in the top 2% may not be related to good practice. SR noted that a revised approach for sites who are in the bottom 2% would be useful. • Regional Liaison Meetings: JD confirmed that Adam Hill will be conducting a new Regional Liaison meeting with departments. The first meeting was held in the East Region. An additional meeting will be held at Dr Gray's Hospital on 16/09/2025 where 	

		<p>there have been recent issues regarding Surgery, Anesthetics and Internal Medicine. SR noted that the first Regional Liaison meeting was very successful.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NHS Lothian, Plastics Surgery: DMcG asked about future Quality Engagement meetings for Plastic Surgery. JD confirmed that Natalie Bain will be organising these and meeting will include discussions with DMEs and TPDs. 	
5.2	Specialty Reports		
5.2.1	Specialty Reports – Highlights not Raised Elsewhere	<p>AM summarised the TPD reports including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study Leave Budgets: AM noted that various TPDs have raised issues related to Study Budgets. AM noted that a Study Budget group has been set up and will be looking at centrally funded models. • Endoscopy Training: AM highlighted the ongoing issues regarding surgical resident doctors accessing JAG courses. AM confirmed that the new General Surgical curriculum is expected to mandate JAG courses which will influence the discussion regarding central funding. AM noted that this issue will be explored further. • T&O Expansion Posts: PW asked whether there was a possibility of further expansion posts in T&O. AM suggested that PW present a paper at the March 2026 meeting. AM noted that any request should be based on predicted demand for future consultants rather than service pressures at RDiT level. 	
5.3	Resident Doctors Reports		
5.3.1	ASiT	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A resident doctor rep was not available 	
5.3.2	BOTA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A resident doctor rep was not available 	

5.4	Service & Workforce		
5.4.1	DME Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SR confirmed that there were no issues to discuss 	
5.5	Professional & Academic		
5.5.1	Royal College of Surgeons, Edinburgh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A RCoSE rep was not available 	
5.5.2	Royal College of Physicians & Surgeons, Glasgow	<p>JCB gave the members the following update including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Glasgow Surgical Forum: JCB confirmed that the Glasgow Surgical Forum workshop 'Surgical Complications' will be held on 27th & 28th November. This has been organised in conjunction with ASiT and ASGBI. Presidents Conference: A meeting will be held in November to discuss the impact of AI in surgery. JMC confirmed that this was free to attend. Presidential Visits: JMC confirmed that the college president will be touring hospital sites for discussion with members. Robotic Training: JMC confirmed that the college is planning to invest in a robotic trainer which will be available to all Scottish and Northern Irish resident doctors. 	
5.5.3	Royal College of Surgeons, England	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> VS confirmed that the college president will be visiting sites between 26/11/2025 and 28/11/2025. In addition to this, the college will be holding a festival of surgery where resident doctors can submit presentations. VS stated that she will circulate links to these events when they are available. 	VS to circulate links to upcoming RCSEng events to members when available
5.6	Head of Schools Report		

5.6.1	COPSS June 2025	<p>AM confirmed that the following issues were discussed at the June meeting including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • OMFS Programme: AM confirmed that this will move to a run-through model due to difficulties in recruitment. AM confirmed that two ST3 posts were changed to ST1 posts this year and there was a 100% fill rate. • AI & Recruitment: See Item 5.1.5 • JAG Accreditation in Surgery: See Item 5.2.1 • National Online Curriculum Programme: AM noted that this is being led mainly by consultants in England. Work on this project will proceed, however, funding is not guaranteed due to various changes within NHS England. 	
5.7	Academic Report		
5.7.1	General Update	<p>Various issues regarding academic training were discussed including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Academic Rep Attendance: AM suggested that the two academic reps be invited to the STB once a year. • SCREDS: PW confirmed that a short-life working group has been set up to revise the SCREDS model. The group will review recruitment, terms and conditions, integration, flexible working etc. AM suggested inviting Alan Denison to give the STB an update on developments in March 2026. 	<p>AM to consider best model for academic representation at STB</p> <p>RBS to include SCREDS discussion item in March meeting agenda. AM will invite Alan Denison to present update</p>
5.8	BMA		
5.8.1	Consultant Rep	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A consultant rep was not available 	

5.8.2	Resident Doctor Rep	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A resident doctor rep was not available 	
6.	Other Reports		
6.1	Lay Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The lay rep was not available 	
7.	AOB		
7.1	Membership List	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> AM asked members to check their details on the membership and send RBS details of any deputies 	All to check personal contact details on membership list and send RBS details of any changes, deputies etc.
8.	Next Meeting	<p>Next Meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 13/11/2025 (10:00 – 12:00) via TEAMS <p>Proposed Meeting Dates for 2026:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 10/03/2026 (10:00 – 12:00) via TEAMS 10/09/2026 (10:00 – 12:00) via TEAMS 01/12/2026 (10:00 – 12:00) via TEAMS <p>Proposed TPD Report deadline dates:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24/02/2026 27/08/2026 17/11/2026 	